

EUROBODALLA SHIRE COUNCIL

PUBLIC FORUM

Ordinary Meeting of Council on 20 February 2024

Please refer to the minutes of the [Council Meeting](#) for outcomes of the agenda items.

Name	Subject/Comments	Presentation Provided	Hybrid
Edward Fernon	PSR24/001 Planning Proposal - 207 Broulee Road	Not provided	In person
Ruby Mason	PSR24/001 Planning Proposal - 207 Broulee Road	Not provided	In person
Karen-Ann Whyte	PSR24/001 Planning Proposal - 207 Broulee Road	Yes	In person
Andrew Bain	PSR24/001 Planning Proposal - 207 Broulee Road	Not provided	In person
Harry Bingley	PSR24/001 Planning Proposal - 207 Broulee Road	Not provided	In person
Andrew Dix	PSR24/001 Planning Proposal - 207 Broulee Road	Not provided	In person
Deb Stevenson, A Better Eurobodalla	PSR24/001 Planning Proposal - 207 Broulee Road	Yes	Zoom
Dr Anthony Martin	PSR24/001 Planning Proposal - 207 Broulee Road	Not provided	In person
Trish Hellier	PSR24/001 Planning Proposal - 207 Broulee Road	Yes	In person

KAREN-ANN WHYTE.

The proposal for Eco-Friendly accommodation for Health Care Workers.

The proposal to offer eco-friendly accommodation for healthcare workers stems from a recognition of the critical nature of their work and inherit stress and challenges they face daily. I have been privileged to work at Moruya Hospital for 20 years and have been saddened when skilful Midwives and Doctors can't accept job opportunities due to a lack of available accommodation.

This lack of long-term accommodation options for healthcare workers, and their families shows an urgent need for initiatives like the proposed eco-friendly housing project.

Providing them with a sustainable living environment that prioritizes mental health, overall wellness, wellbeing and contributing to environmental preservation while not on duty aligns with the ethos of caring for our community.

Nurses and midwives, as front-line workers, dedicate themselves to caring for others, often neglecting their own well-being in the process.

In reading the Agrihood prospectus I read how Edward is passionate about improving people's health and well being and has been an ambassador for the BlackDog institute for many years.

It is through such initiatives such as Agrihood that we can pave the way for a healthier, more sustainable future for all.

ABE Public Forum Presentation regarding PSR24/001 Planning Proposal The Farm - 207 Broulee Road.

Good afternoon. Thank you for the opportunity to address Council regarding PSR24/001 Planning Proposal - 207 Broulee Road.

I am presenting on behalf of A Better Eurobodalla (ABE), a community forum dedicated to having open, accountable and responsive government. ABE believes that the key principles for good governance are transparency, clear communication and meaningful consultation based on accurate, professional advice. The Planning Proposal before you today does not meet any of these criteria and should not receive your support to proceed to Gateway Determination.

The report from Council's Planning and Sustainability Services lays out very clearly multiple reasons why this Planning Proposal should not be supported.

At the strategic level, an independent assessment by a planning consultant found that the Planning Proposal contradicts:

1. both Regional and local planning strategies, such as the Rural Lands Strategy, as well as State Environmental Planning Policies and numerous Ministerial Directions under the *NSW Environmental Planning and Assessment Act*;
2. the intended character of development in the C4 Environment Living zone and the proposed uses which are allowed in this zone under the Eurobodalla Local Environment Plan; and
3. preliminary work on the Eurobodalla Housing Strategy which has already identified lands suitable to be developed for housing to adequately meet projected population growth in the shire beyond 2041.

This independent assessment also found that although the Planning Proposal describes the development as an "Agrihood" (a term with no formal meaning), the block sizes and proposed housing types are actually urban in character. Consequently the density of the proposed development will require the provision of significant infrastructure (roads, drainage etc) which has not been planned or budgeted for and which will put an enormous strain on Council resources. It will divert funding away from existing growth areas at Batemans Bay, Tomakin, Rosedale, Moruya South and Dalmeny and impact Council works across the shire.

This unsolicited Planning Proposal will add an extra 800 houses and an estimated 1,800 residents to Broulee impacting both the character of Broulee Village and the adjacent Illawong Nature Reserve which surrounds it to the north, south and east. The wetlands in the Nature Reserve constitute endangered vegetation which provides habitat for a number of threatened species. The Planning Proposal has not explained how it will avoid impacting on these wetlands and the threatened species they support, as well as the associated waterways. Large areas of endangered vegetation have already been cleared around Broulee to accommodate over 400 new houses as part of the Broulee Beach Estate, which has seen the size of Broulee grow by 50%. This Planning Proposal would almost double that again.

If the report provided by Council's Planning and Sustainability Services does not convince you that this Planning Proposal lacks strategic and site-specific merit, then consider the approach and track record of the developer, Brightlands Living. This Sydney-based developer has consistently failed to provide Council with adequate documentation to back claims that his development would be sustainable and environmentally beneficial. He has not provided details about how his Planning Proposal will increase the diversity and affordability of housing in the Eurobodalla. He has attempted to justify proposed commercial uses, which are prohibited in the C4 Environmental Living zone, by saying that he will prepare a site-specific Development Control Plan to allow for this type land use. This is not possible under NSW planning legislation. He has also failed to demonstrate how the environmentally sensitive areas surrounding the Planning Proposal would be protected and impacts on the aquatic habitats avoided. To quote Council's report *'the Planning Proposal and supporting documentation has not considered any environmental investigations, geotechnical limitations, community engagement or cost estimates associated with servicing the development'*.

There are multiple inconsistencies in this half-baked proposal, which fails to demonstrate how many of the so-called benefits will be achieved in practice. So much so, that the independent planning consultant concludes by saying *'the proposal represents a large urban expansion that seeks to present itself as a low density environmental living development in a currently un-serviced and isolated rural area requiring significant infrastructure development'*.

The community was not consulted throughout this process, instead the developer spoke to a few select entities, most of whom are now adamant that their responses have been misrepresented as support for the Planning Proposal in the documentation provided to Council. This raises questions of probity and throws into doubt the credibility of the developer. So what are his credentials and his track record in relation to environmentally sustainable development? Ed Fernon is the CEO of Brightlands Living, there is no one else. He was a property consultant in Brisbane before heading up Brightlands Living which only has 3 projects on its website : one in Leura, which is Brightlands Wellness Retreat; a draft proposal at Hilltop, which appears to be a retreat and function centre, and another draft proposal for a high rise at Woolloongabba in Queensland. There is no evidence he has any background in the kind of development being proposed for Broulee.

The Planning Proposal does not follow accepted planning practice, is inconsistent with existing planning strategies, has not provided sufficient supporting documentation and has not engaged openly and honestly with the affected community. By voting to support it you will be setting a dangerous precedent for unplanned, unwanted and inappropriate development in the Eurobodalla. This may make some residents question whether their Councillors are really representing the community rather than an opportunistic property developer. Consequently, I urge you to take on board the advice provided by Council's planning staff and vote to reject this Planning Proposal.

Good afternoon Mayor, Councillors, General Manager, Staff, Gallery and those comfortable zooming from home my name is Patricia Hellier from Batemans Bay.

PSR24/001 Planning Proposal 207 Broulee Road Broulee. I am here today to speak against this proposal and I support the Councils Staff's recommendation to the Councillors that is not to support this proposal.

From the onset I am not a resident of Broulee, and I am not against development providing it sits with the Eurobodalla LEP.

It should be recognised by this current group of Councillors the lengthy time it took for the Rural Lands LEP some 12 to 13 years. Councillor Pollock was a Councillor during this period and Councillor Mayne was a Councillor towards the end of the process. I attended a workshop and many of the Council meetings and public meetings. The Rural Lands committee devoted hours of their time during the Rural Lands process.

Here today we have a proposal by a developer that will require a rezoning of land changing it from RU1 to C4 Environmental Living. I have to question, why did we go through such a long lengthy Rural Land process if a zoning can be changed to accommodate such a large scale development and if this is successful what sort of precedent will it set?

We currently have a large number of blocks of land available in this shire for sale being the Rosedale Development, Oaks Ranch Development and the Moruya Development.

In reading through this document it appears to tick all the boxes listing it as a "agrihood and eco-village principals". In the proposal it states there will be large market gardens, a wellness centre & a bath house, a day spa & treatments, daily classes of yoga, tai chi, aqua aerobics etc. There are bike and walking trails proposed. It is proposed there will be a commercial building, restaurant/cafe, amphitheatre and education precinct, along with a communal kitchen and dining area.

With all these facilities listed they will come with a cost. As we all know the normal rates, water and sewerage charges will apply there will also have to be a form of "strata fee" to cover the cost of the various facilities and daily classes. This development appears to be geared to the "wealthy".

I note it states there are developments in Victoria "The Cape" and WA "The Witchcliff" these developments are on a much smaller scale and it should be noted that it states with the increase of building cost the "Witchcliff" next stage of development housing cost has been quoted as \$970,000.

In the proposal it states 7.7 hectares will be retained as rural land to be used for livestock grazing this is not viable as the maximum beef that could be raised on this size land would be 4 and there would be a requirement of continual hand feeding.

It should be noted in the proposal there is a quote of a height of 8.5 mtrs this is equivalent to 3 story building height.

In relation to water and sewerage a development of this size will require a large amount of infrastructure and resources this will ultimately reflect on this Council's resources.

You would all probably be aware over the weekend on various social media sites there were a large number of comments over this development. I was sent copies of a number of these comments. There was one blogger who was defending the development and answering a number of the comments. In doing some research I found this person to be the owner of "The Bower" at Broulee.

In the document provided by Brightlands Living Pty Ltd there is an “option to purchase “The Bower” therefore the Face Book blogger who was also part of the Video provided by Brightlands Living Pty Ltd has a financial interested for this development to be approval.

There has already been a noticeable increase in the population in Eurobodalla since Covid. Should this development go ahead the closest shopping area will be Moruya.

We are all aware that the proposal of a by pass for Moruya is now off the books, we all know what happens with the bottle neck at the Moruya Bridge on a daily basis. Therefore a development of this size will put further strain the Moruya area.

A proposal of this scale is large and according to a statement on one of the Face Books sites there will be available finance. With such a large financial outlay I have to wonder just who is Brightlands Pty. Ltd?

Councillor PLEASE I ask that you take the advice from the Council Staff and do not approve this development.

Patricia Hellier