#### **EUROBODALLA SHIRE COUNCIL**

#### **PUBLIC FORUM**

#### All members of the community who have registered have been advised that they have a **maximum of seven minutes** to put their case.

#### Ordinary Meeting of Council on 28 March 2023.

No.	Name	Subject/Comments	Presentation	Hybrid	For/against
1	Lisa Ryan	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	No	Zoom	Against
2	Michael Weyman	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	No	Zoom	For
3	Tara Ward	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	No	Zoom	Against
4	Sonja Scherer	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	No	Zoom	Against
5	Andrew Mehl	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	No	In person	For
6	Louise Webb	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	Yes	In person	Against
7	Craig Young	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	No	In person	For
8	Coral Anderson	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	Yes	In person	Against
9	Mathew Irving	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	No	In person	For
10	Peter Cormick	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	Yes	In person	Against
11	Keith Dance	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	Yes	In person	For
12	Anne Cormick	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	Yes	In person	Against
13	Patricia Hellier	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	Yes	In person	For
14	Dr Di Evans, speaking on behalf of RSPCA Australia and RSPCA NSW	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	Yes	In person	Against
15	Dr Philip Creagh	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	Yes	In person	For
16	Tom Slockee (Coral Anderson presenting)	PSR23/007 Licence for Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground	Yes	In person	Against
17	Kathryn Maxwell, President, SHASA	PSR23/011 Draft Electric Vehicle Charging Infrastructure Strategy	Yes	In person	-

#### PRESENTATION BY LOUISE WEBB VIA PUBLIC FORUM

#### PSR23/007 LICENCE FOR MORUYA RODEO - MORUYA SHOWGROUND

#### 28 March 2023

Councillors, today you are being asked to approve an event which:

- is vehemently opposed by every animal welfare organisation;
- is banned or partially banned in the ACT, Victoria and South Australia, the UK, the Netherlands, Germany, and parts of the US, Canada and New Zealand;
- requires a special exemption from the *Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act*;
- has been shown by scientific studies to cause fear, distress and injury to the animals involved; and
- operates under a totally inadequate 35-year-old code of practice that has never been updated.

In its submission on this issue, RSPCA called rodeo practices "inhumane".

Injury risks include lacerations, abrasions, bruising and muscle and tissue damage. A study in 2017 showed that over 70% of bucking bulls showed muscle and bone injuries, and also that these animals were 13 times more likely than non-bucking bulls to have a spinal disorder.

Injury risks from calf roping include damage to the windpipe and soft tissues of the neck, bruising and broken ribs from being forced to the ground, and choking from being dragged along the ground.

In the report prepared by council staff, supporters of the rodeo are mentioned as "not observing instances of cruelty at this event".

Well, they obviously weren't watching on 1 January this year, when others at the Moruya Rodeo witnessed workers hitting animals, pulling their ears and horns and twisting their tails. One horse was so terrified it ran headlong into a metal fence, and a steer was so distressed in the chute that he caught his horn and almost ripped it off. Observers saw his horn hanging loosely, which would have been incredibly painful. As if seeing this was not enough, we also don't know when or even if this animal was attended to by a vet, because the rodeo operators are able to keep all that information secret. Why? What are they hiding?

In any case, the point about witnessing cruelty or not is irrelevant. If rodeos were not cruel, they would not need a special exemption from prosecution under the *Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act.* 

To make the point even further, as recently as 20 January this year, RSPCA Australia put out a media release calling for the banning of calf roping because a new study has shown it to be, and I quote, "frightening and cruel".

Confronting the cruelty inherent in rodeo events would not require this council to make some monumental step; rather, it would keep this shire in line with community values and expectations: research carried out by the firm McCrindle in 2022 showed that 67% of Australians said they were concerned or very concerned about the welfare of animals in rodeos. This was up from 52% in 2015. The trend is very clear, and the social licence for these events is, in the words of the RSPCA, "increasingly vulnerable".

The report before councillors today appears to encourage them to take comfort from the fact that there is a code of practice that should be adhered to by rodeo operators. That code was written a generation ago, and was meant to be reviewed at least every two years, in order to, and here I am quoting from the code itself, "maintain the highest possible standards".

What has happened in the 35 years since the code's inception? I can point to at least five academic studies that demonstrate the harm done to animals in rodeos, yet not one revision has been made to the code. It still allows for animals to fed and watered only once in 24 hours, to be kept in a vehicle without food or water for up to 24 hours, for electric prods to be used, and has no requirement for a vet to be in attendance at rodeo events. Are these the highest possible standards?

I have obtained access, through the NSW Department of Primary Industries, to documents going back to 2005 relating to the rodeo code of practice. These documents reveal the strongly-held belief of the Animal Welfare Advisory Council, a body established by the NSW Government, that a vet must be present at every rodeo event. These documents also reveal the equally strong pushback from the Australian Bushmen's Campdraft and Rodeo Association, the body that Mr Craig Young represents, against this proposal, and, as I said earlier, the presence of a vet is still not a requirement of the code of practice.

I've heard the arguments about animals being specifically bred, that they are well cared for, etc. Those are claims made by people with a vested interest. You all heard Mr Young last November airily dismiss the findings of a study showing distress in calves in rodeo situations, and I have sent you all the response to Mr Young from that study's lead author, Dr Michelle Sinclair. So claims made by rodeo proponents should be taken with a grain of salt. And, in any case, all the care in the world outside a rodeo setting does not excuse the mistreatment at those events. It's like saying you only beat your children on Mondays.

This should be an easy decision, councillors, if you make your judgement based on the clear, unarguable evidence of the harm done by rodeo events. Relying on the State Government for leadership on this issue is, in my view, just closing your eyes to animals in distress, when you have this golden opportunity to help them.

#### Good morning Councillors

My name is Coral Anderson. I'm here today to speak against the application for a 5 year licence renewal lodged by Moruya Rodeo. We know that this event has been a tradition for many years and I get that traditions are hard to break. But times DO change and when we know better, we do better. For example, many years ago, kids would sit on their parents laps in the front seat of the car, no seat belts and no child restraints. We also used to smoke in offices, public places including hospitals, council buildings and restaurants with no regard for the harm that such ignorance was affecting others.

I represent Animal Liberation Batemans Bay. There are currently approximately 450 members. In November 2022, a hard copy petition was tabled by Peter Cormick on my behalf opposing the rodeo licence. Restrictions imposed by the government concerning the covid 19 outbreak prevented us from obtaining many hundreds or even perhaps thousands more signatories via local street stalls and markets.

The Regulations that sit beneath the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act afford an exemption to animals who are forced to perform in rodeos. Why is that do you think? Otherwise, the cruelty and torment inflicted upon them would be illegal. This needs to change at a State level. But you can do something at a local level by determining not to renew the licence under consideration today. Whilst campaigning, many people spoke to me personally and suggested an alternate event such as a music festival over the New Year's Day weekend. Or even a more inclusive event such as that proposed by the Animal Justice Party back in 2016 which the old council rejected over Huntfest. As you are no doubt aware, Huntfest eventually died a natural death. Much has been publicised about the cruelty of calf roping. However, there are
other cruel aspects to the rodeo event that need to be highlighted.

Animal deaths in rodeos are no accident. Bulls are the animals most killed at or by rodeos. These normally placid animals are subjected to phenomenally tight ropes strapped around their chest and back. Rodeo bulls are most prized while they are trashing about attempting to rid the belts and riders from their tormented bodies. They are not meant for this type of action. Spinning around and around renders the bull dizzy and disoriented. It is this action that can cause their hind leg(s) to snap. They are also subject to spinal injury. However, this type of injury only becomes apparent when the bull has left the arena and out of sight where it can be seen shaking, unstable and near collapse. Such catastrophic injuries are not compatible with life.

Horses are also at risk of life threatening injuries. For example, degloving. This occurs when the horse kicks out in the chute and gets caught between the rails.

No animal welfare agency in the world supports or condones rodeos.

Many countries, including the ACT in Australia, have already banned these events.

Just as Tweed Council did earlier this year, the reality is that you councillors have the power today, regardless of any legislation, rules, regulations and codes, to say NO to the renewal of the rodeo licence on land managed by you.

Most of you were elected on a platform of being progressives and advocates of social reform.

Please be that social reform.

Thank you

#### PUBLIC FORUM PRESENTATION BY PETER CORMICK, 28 MARCH 2023

#### ITEM PSR23/007 LICENCE FOR MORUYA RODEO – MORUYA SHOWGROUND

Councillors,

As a starting point, I think it's fair to assume that the person in the street would, if asked, express some form of objection to animal cruelty; ideally, condemnation of it. There would surely be no one who would speak in support of it.

At the Public Forum held on 22 November last year, we heard Mr Craig Young, Executive Officer of the Australian Bushmen's Campdraft and Rodeo Association (ABCRA), say that rodeo animals are "held in high regard", and that one cannot say that "the rodeo industry doesn't love its animals". He also said that "We don't want to see them injured ... they're too valuable"!

And so, how can it be that those responsible for what I and many others regard as blatant cruelty, inflicted upon defenceless rodeo animals, declare love for those same animals?

Well, just as beauty is said to be in the eye of the beholder, it would seem that the same can be said of love and cruelty.

I ask each of you to look at the accompanying photos and decide, honestly, whether you see animal cruelty on display. That dear horse, in obvious, extreme distress, is about to have those spurs run along his (or her) flanks, again and again. Here are some descriptions of just what competitors are expected to do in the Bareback Bronc event, as provided by both the Australian Professional Rodeo Association (APRA) and the Australian Bushmen's Campdraft and Rodeo Association (ABCRA):

"Ideally bareback riders want to try to spur the horse on each jump, reaching as far forward as they can with their feet, then jerking their spurs upwards towards the rigging" (ABCRA). "The high spurring action of the bareback rider produces some of the wildest and most exciting rides in rodeo.... The higher and wider the spurring action – the better the score."(APRA)

And the calves .... chased, strangled and thrown down like a rag doll- as though they are a *thing*, without feelings!

But, returning to the question of just what is and is not cruelty, we fortunately have an adjudicator, thus removing the need for personal opinion. We have the POCTA Act. At section 4(2) it defines cruelty as including:

... any act or omission as a consequence of which the animal is **unreasonably**, **unnecessarily** or **unjustifiably**--

(a) ... kicked, ... wounded, ... maimed, abused, tormented, tortured, terrified or infuriated,

(b) ... over-worked, ... , over-ridden or over-used,

(c) exposed to excessive heat or excessive cold, or

#### (d) inflicted with pain.

This is a list of the very cruelty inflicted upon animals at rodeos and in the transport and yarding periods leading up to and following them.

Thus, according to the NSW parliament, rodeo animals do indeed suffer cruelty; cruelty so serious that it would ordinarily result in prosecution under the POCTA Act.

But exemptions within the POCTA Regulation, *seemingly* allow for this cruelty to take place. The existence of the exemptions is objective proof that cruelty does indeed take place because if there were no cruelty, there would be no need for them.

Critically, however, these exemptions relate only to sections 18, 18A and 20 of the POCTA Act, which specifically prohibit rodeo-related cruelties. They do not relate to the all-important, over-arching sections 5 and 6 of the Act, which simply prohibit the commission of an act of cruelty upon an animal. *There are no rodeo-related exemptions to these sections*. It appears that there has been a major oversight by those who organised the existing exemptions. I have received advice from a lawyer expert in this field, who has confirmed that, indeed, prosecution could and should be initiated for breaches of sections 5 and 6 of the Act for the cruelties inflicted on animals at rodeos. I look to the RSPCA to do something about this. This legal advice included confirmation that the exemptions at clause 36 of the Regulation contain a serious omission concerning public attendance. The exemptions apply <u>only</u> to "premises", being "any place which is <u>not</u> a public place". But the Moruya Showground is very much a public place, and therefore a place to which the exemptions do <u>not</u> apply.

But legalities aside, as I have said in my submission (which is attached and forms part of my presentation), this issue is a moral one and one that concerns societal values. It is one for your conscience, your heart of hearts.

Please ask yourselves how you would vote if your vote were to be made anonymously, as in a secret ballot, so that no one would ever know how you voted. To be true to yourself, that is how you should be voting today.

And please ask yourselves, if you were to vote to allow *any* form of the cruelty to continue, would you be prepared to inflict that cruelty on the animals yourself? Because *allowing* cruelty is every bit as culpable as inflicting it directly.

Watching and cheering on while animals suffer is both socially unacceptable and morally unacceptable – it is to be condemned. The normalisation of such abuse is especially damaging to children. *It is not normal to abuse animals*.

You have the authority to make a positive, societal change, to bring an end to a so-called tradition of animal abuse. You can vote to either allow the cruelty to continue or vote to bring it to an end.

Thank you for your time and attention.





### SUBMISSION

То

Eurobodalla Shire Council

On the

#### MORUYA RODEO LICENCE RENEWAL APPLICATION

By

Peter Cormick

24 January 2023

**BLANK PAGE** 

#### Councillors,

#### THE MORUYA RODEO – APPLICATION TO COUNCIL FOR RENEWAL OF LICENCE

- 1. For those of you who condemn all forms of animal cruelty, the issue before you, of whether to renew the licence which would allow the Moruya New Year's Day rodeo to continue, is straightforward. But for those who declare some form of opposition to animal cruelty but are 'uncomfortable' about upsetting 'tradition', the issue may not be so straightforward. And for others still, it is not worth discussing! It is to the second category, being those councillors who are in a quandary, that my submission is directed.
- 2. In my youth, when I was involved with horses, I found rodeos entertaining, and as recently as six months ago I would not have given a second thought to the morality or legality of a rodeo. It was not something that had entered my mind, for many decades. More recently, though, with 'the facts' having been brought to my attention, I have been, and remain, shocked at the cruelty inflicted upon animals at rodeos. I must say that I am ashamed of myself for my unawareness and for not having come to this realisation years ago.
- 3. Here are photos of but four examples of the cruelty that I and many others condemn outright. To allow such abuse of animals to continue is to condone it and to thereby, through inaction, support these forms of cruelty. Other graphic examples, in larger format, are provided at the end of this submission<sup>1</sup>.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The first two graphics, above, have been provided by Animal Liberation NSW and the following two, on page 4, have been copied from the RSPCA website.



- 4. The blatant cruelty that takes place at a rodeo, in a modern, supposedly enlightened society, is indeed a very large elephant in the room. It is well past the time when this cruelty is called out for what it is for the silence and the apathy to be replaced by condemnation and action, to bring the cruelty to an end. It is appalling that the brutality inflicted upon very young, terrified calves is presented as family entertainment, as part of a 'great day out for all'.
- 5. I can only wonder at anyone not being shocked by the images shown here, and elsewhere, and particularly by the videos linked below. If any of you do not experience abhorrence at seeing how these innocent, defenceless, sentient creatures are brutalised, for the sake of family entertainment no less, then I truly despair. It is **not normal** to brutalize animals. Yet at a rodeo it seems to be so. A person who might give calf roping 'a go' on his own property would face

prosecution under the <u>Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act 1979</u> (the Act). But not in the rodeo arena. It is utterly absurd that the same infliction of cruelty is both (questionably) legally acceptable and criminal at the same time, depending on where it takes place.

- 6. Even though we can, and I do, get into legal arguments on this issue, it really is a simple moral one. It is about what is right and what is wrong. There are many variations of the quote (seemingly incorrectly and often) attributed to Mahatma Gandhi, that "One can measure the greatness of a nation and its moral progress by the way it treats its animals." There is so much truth in this view of the significance of our relationships with animals. We, as a society, have a very long way to go in our development.
- 7. Animals are not 'things' to be used, subjugated, or abused. The rodeo animals in particular: horses, bulls, steers and calves, are in every sense, sentient beings. They, like us, experience sensations and feelings of pleasure, pain, stress, and terror, in response to a current experience and, in relying on the memory of previous experiences, stress and terror in anticipation of impending abuse. I trust that each of you share this appreciation of animal sentience, because it is fundamental to your considerations and the decision you will make: whether to allow a continuation of the abuse or to put an end to it.
- 8. As you well know, the governing body, of which you are a member, has the authority to bring this cruelty to an end, within our shire. It simply requires just five of you who have the will and courage to do so. In so voting you would not only be doing what is morally right but, also, what is legally required under the Act. Section 5(1) of the Act states plainly that "A person shall not commit an act of cruelty upon an animal."
- 9. <u>Section 4(2)</u> of the Act defines cruelty as including

... a reference to any act or omission as a consequence of which the animal is **unreasonably**, **unnecessarily** or **unjustifiably**--

(a) beaten, kicked, killed, wounded, pinioned, mutilated, maimed, abused, tormented, tortured, terrified or infuriated,

- (b) over-loaded, over-worked, over-driven, over-ridden or over-used,
- (c) exposed to excessive heat or excessive cold, or
- (d) inflicted with pain.

(Emphases added)

You will of course see in this list **the very cruelty inflicted upon animals at rodeos** and in the transport and yarding periods leading up to and following them.

- 10. It is likely that you have had your attention drawn to clause <u>36(3)</u> of the <u>Prevention of Cruelty to</u> <u>Animals Regulation 2012</u> (the Regulation), which 'provides' specific exemptions for rodeos from the prohibitions under sections <u>18(1)</u>, <u>18A</u> and <u>20</u> of the Act, provided that the "<u>relevant Code of Practice</u>" (the Code) is complied with. And, at section 36(4), even if the Code is not complied with, the exemption is maintained provided that "the person" has "done all that the person could reasonably be expected to have done to comply with that Code."!
- 11. If you have taken the time to read the Code, produced **35 years ago**, in 1988, you will see that there is no reference whatever to any revisions of it, even though the Code itself states that it "should be reviewed at intervals of no longer than 2 years to maintain the highest possible standards"! Such an appalling absence of competence and governance integrity is entirely in

keeping with everything else associated with the conduct of rodeos, with absurd exemptions that allow for cruelty that, outside the rodeo arena, would incur swift prosecution.

12. Paragraph 1.2 of the Code matter-of-factly states that rodeo animals will experience many forms of abuse:

"Animals participating in rodeo events, or being transported, yarded and handled for use in rodeo events, may be subjected to a number of stresses which may have cumulative effects. Stressful influences may include:

- yarding and handling
- deprivation of food and water
- changes in climatic conditions
- overcrowding or isolation
- unfamiliar surroundings, noises and sensations
- insufficient care during transportation
- use of rodeo equipment [such as electric prods, lassoes, flank straps, spurs, etc]

Animals likely to be most affected are those which are not accustomed to rodeo events."

This casual itemisation of the types of abuse, including the euphemistic "changes in climate conditions" (sweltering heat or freezing conditions), and the remark that those poor creatures who are new to it will suffer most, is particularly appalling. Clearly, the animals are seen as no more than objects, without there being the slightest regard for their physical or psychological wellbeing. The focus is on ensuring that none of them experience physical injury, that might impair their 'performance'. Though, of course, bruising and non-life-threatening internal bleeding will go unnoticed. They will experience whatever abuse is handed out.

And paragraphs within section 3 of the Code, again, casually describe 'requirements' in relation to the "Transport, Yarding and Handling of Animals":

"3.4 Animals should be fed and watered at least once every 24 hours. More frequent feeding and watering may be necessary as determined by work levels and weather conditions.

3.5 No stock should be confined in a vehicle beyond a period of 24 hours, without being unloaded, properly fed, watered and rested. ... On hot days trucks should rest under shade if possible.

...

3.11 Standard electric prods shall be used as little as possible and may be powered by battery or dynamo only. Prods must be in accordance with the regulations under the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act and must not be used inside the arena."

These 'requirements' allow for animals to be without both food **and** water for up to 24 hours and to remain on a truck for up to 24 hours! By any standard, such abuse is extraordinary, blatant cruelty. And even beyond 24 hours, there is no mandatory "must" or "shall", but only "should", with no indication whatever of enforcement of these aspects of the Code.

- 13. The sections of the Act referred to in the clause 36 list of exemptions, being ss 18(1), 18A and 20, prohibit, outside the rodeo arena, the very cruelty that these exemptions 'permit' e.g., confining, releasing, chasing and capturing an animal! Clearly, the rodeo industry has a lot of clout, and very able at involving itself in the drafting of relevant legislation.
- 14. However, all is not as it might seem. The Regulation is subordinate to the Act and must therefore support, elaborate upon but not conflict with the Act that has enabled it. But clause 36(3) of the Regulation most certainly does conflict with the Act. Had the exemptions been written into the

Act, even within section 5 itself, concerning the prohibition on cruelty to animals, then, possibly, they would have had the status necessary to achieve such exemption, even given the absurdity of prohibiting but permitting cruelty in the one breath. To the extent that it conflicts with the Act, clause 36 is inarguably *ultra vires* (beyond its powers).

15. The Act is very clear in both its objects<sup>2</sup> and in its prohibition on cruelty to animals:

#### **3 OBJECTS OF ACT**

The objects of this Act are--

- (a) to prevent cruelty to animals, and
- (b) to promote the welfare of animals by requiring a person in charge of an animal--
  - (i) to provide care for the animal, and
  - (ii) to treat the animal in a humane manner, and
  - (iii) to ensure the welfare of the animal, and
  - •••

And the Act's prohibition on cruelty to animals is unequivocal:

#### **5 CRUELTY TO ANIMALS**

(1) A person shall not commit an act of cruelty upon an animal. ...

16. Critically, s 35 of the Act requires that the Regulation be "not inconsistent" with the Act. Certainly, regulations, generally, provide for certain exemptions to the provisions and requirements of the enabling Act but they must not be inconsistent with that Act. The exemptions 'provided' for rodeos at clause 36 of the Regulation are, to use a legal term, repugnant to the Act.

#### **35 REGULATIONS**

(1) The Governor may make regulations, **not inconsistent** with this Act, for or with respect to any matter that by this Act is required or permitted to be prescribed or that is necessary or convenient to be prescribed for carrying out or giving effect to this Act and, in particular, for or with respect to ... (Emphasis added)

17. Further, the Regulation is required to have met the Guidelines set out at Schedule 1 of the *Subordinate Legislation Act 1989*, which, in part, state:

#### SUBORDINATE LEGISLATION ACT 1989 – SCHEDULE 1 GUIDELINES FOR THE PREPARATION OF STATUTORY RULES (Section 4)

...

Before a statutory rule is proposed to be made--

(a) The objectives sought to be achieved and the reasons for them must be clearly formulated.

(b) Those objectives are to be checked to **ensure** that they--

• are reasonable and appropriate, and

• accord with the objectives, principles, spirit and intent of the enabling Act, and

• are not inconsistent with the objectives of other Acts, statutory rules and stated government policies.

(Emphases added)

Very clearly, clause 36 of the Regulation does not satisfy the Guidelines. On every count, this clause is patently *ultra vires*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "At common law, statutory provisions are, if possible, to be construed so as to give effect to their purpose [the Objects] of the statute." P. Herzfeld, T. Prince: Interpretation, 2nd ed, 2020, Lawbook Co., Sydney, p 151

- 18. But, please, do not think that because these highly questionable exemptions currently exist that you are somehow obliged to provide approval for a licence renewal. That is absolutely not the case. The only obligation that you have is to do what is morally right and bring the cruelty to an end.
- 19. As you know, and as you would expect, all animal welfare organisations oppose rodeos. <u>Animal Liberation NSW</u> has been highly vocal in advocating for the banning of rodeos and is responsible for bringing my attention to the cruelty that I had previously simply not comprehended. Most of the photos I have incorporated into my submission have been provided by AL.
- 20. The highly respected **RSPCA** has stated its opposition to rodeos, plainly and unequivocally:

#### The RSPCA is opposed to rodeo and rodeo schools<sup>3</sup>

The <u>RSPCA is particularly critical of calf roping</u> (rope and tie) and has drawn attention to a <u>recent</u> <u>study</u> which provides further, rigorous, scientific evidence, if that is needed for the naysayers, that "calf roping is a terrifying and distressing event for the animals involved throughout all stages of this cruel rodeo event". The following video is included in the first of these links: <u>https://youtu.be/tRLJqRGQzTs</u>. *Please view it.* 

21. And the high profile, highly respected animal welfare organisation, **Animals Australia**, has this to say of rodeos:

#### "In these cruel and contrived events animals are bullied, chased and tormented to prompt unnatural behaviours – all for a few seconds of fleeting 'entertainment'. It's time we put an end to rodeos."<sup>4</sup>

The following video from Animals Australia provides further evidence of the cruelty that can and does take place at rodeos: <u>https://vimeo.com/45347541</u>. *Please view it*.

22. On becoming aware of – seeing and comprehending for the first time - the cruelty that takes place at rodeos, I had decided that, as a matter of strategy (of 'a little at a time'), it would be best to initially advocate for just the removal of the calf-roping (rope and tie) event, being the most blatantly cruel of the events. It is unquestionably a public display of gross *brutality* on the calves, which outside the rodeo ring would have those responsible standing before the courts. But it is now clear to me that, except for the barrel racing, morally and legally, *all* the events involve cruelty. And the legal threshold is easily satisfied when referencing the definition given at section 4(2) of the Act, if that is needed. A list of the standard events at a rodeo are provided on the Australian Professional Rodeo Association website.

And so, to finish off ...

23. In response to any claim that removal of the rodeo would have a marked, negative impact on the local economy, please keep in mind that Moruya has survived very well over the past two years,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> <u>https://kb.rspca.org.au/knowledge-base/what-are-the-animal-welfare-issues-with-rodeos/</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> <u>https://animalsaustralia.org/our-</u>

work/rodeos/?gclid=CjwKCAiAkrWdBhBkEiwAZ9cdcDcdeqpgn4vflCsUQRkLUX65O9nI93tzubA4o7TvRKLT xDnxugLCho CrRkQAvD BwE

when the rodeo did not take place. And to provide some perspective, tourism brings well over \$300 million into our shire each year, provided by approximately 1.3 million visitors<sup>5</sup>. In any event, the need to prevent all forms of animal cruelty, particularly some of the extreme examples which occur at rodeos, well and truly transcends local economics.

- 24. I am acutely aware that to seek the abolition of the local rodeo is highly controversial amongst some if not many members of the local rural community. But I am hopeful that, when the facts of rodeo animal cruelty are properly appreciated and reflected upon by these people, most will accept that rodeos are completely out of place in a modern, enlightened society, in which animals are treated with respect, at the very least, and with kindness wherever possible.
- 25. I have acquaintances and friends associated with the rodeo; and my stance will certainly not be doing anything to enhance those relationships! But, for me, animal welfare very easily prevails over any tensions that may or will result from my condemnation of the cruelty inflicted upon the rodeo animals, particularly upon the calves.
- 26. If ever a picture can be said to be worth a thousand words, it is in this matter. I ask that you please look through the photos in the addendum to this submission and view the following videos, the first of which is an interesting, informative, brief expose' on rodeo in the USA.

https://youtu.be/i9BDHkhc6IQ https://youtu.be/EU6mz5XYIV4 https://vimeo.com/377947145 https://vimeo.com/505121065

- 27. I can only hope that those of you who were undecided before reading my submission and viewing the linked videos, are now in no doubt that 'rodeo cruelty' must not be allowed to continue. This will be a conscience vote. Never mind the legalities; it is a moral issue, pure and simple. Is it right or wrong to inflict cruelty upon animals or to allow the infliction of cruelty? And, if you are still not persuaded by the immorality of the cruelty inflicted, then please access the overwhelming scientific evidence<sup>6</sup>, which provides objective evidence of the suffering. You have the authority to bring an end to the suffering and the long-running de-sensitising, normalisation effects on children of this form of animal cruelty.
- 28. Thank you for taking the time to read through my submission and for the thoughtful considerations I have no doubt you will be bringing to the chamber when a decision is to be made.

been.

Peter Cormick Deua River Valley

PHOTOS FOLLOW IN THE ADDENDUM

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Eurobodalla Destination Action Plan 2018 to 2021, page 8. (Most recent available on Council's website)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Referred to at paragraph 20, and quoted from, but repeated here for convenience.











# CHASED. ACKLED. ABUSED.

# Speak out against rodeo cruelty today.

Animal Liberation

ials Uncov

Scan me to take action,







Councillors this matter in the past should have been a simple receive and note and passed however government regulation has interfered with this process in the guise of "public consultation".

Over the decades the community and council have developed POM for the growth and development of the Showgrounds with two main events in mind, namely the New years Rodeo and the Eurobodalla show held every January. Several years ago, with grant funding the community rebuilt the rodeo yards costing \$70 plus thousand dollars. The rodeo has been an event now for nearly half a century with this years event attracting the largest crowd ever to the point that the gatekeepers stopped taking entry fees at 5.45 as those still coming in would be lucky to be able to see the show. The fact council are considering refusing to allow this event to continue, on the showground is beyond belief.

At the November meeting council was given a petition demanding council refuse the application to continue this event, an event that has been a major tourist attraction for nearly half a century of 400 plus signatures. This was raised by a group who in fact contested the 2016 council elections receiving 2.19% of the vote. Not as they say a mandate for action. With the current elected councillors none of you ran promising to ban the Moruya rodeo if elected. In just over a month council now have a locally gathered petition with over 4000 signatures showing clearly that the local community insist that council support this event to continue.

To be clear our rodeo operates within current legislation and in fact under the ABCRA guidelines are the leaders in improvements to welfare issues in all events. It is always about making sure that the competing stock are not harmed and in fact these animals always receive the best of care. In fact, the only injuries occurring happens to the humans that attempt to ride the athletically trained bulls and horses. That is why at a rodeo it is compulsory that an ambulance must be in attendance at all times.

Those that oppose rodeos do so in the mistaken belief that the stock is harmed or traumatised yet more often as not they are urban centric with no practical knowledge of the handling of livestock and continually attempt to implant human characteristics onto animal behaviour. That is in some cases an insult to the animals. If we take the animal rights groups and vegan's view, they would have humans are to have no contact or usage of any livestock. Interesting scenario if that happened what becomes of the 28 million cattle and 70 million sheep in Australis?

So, councillors where does this nonsense stop? Should the rodeo cease do you also ban the Show from conducting a rodeo as part of the show? Doing that you severely reduce the gate take which then reduces the viability of future shows. Do we also then refuse to allow cages to remain in the poultry pavilion which kills off the poultry section? I suppose next is banning the animal nursery because people are going to traumatise baby the calves, lambs, chickens and whatever else is available. Question also needs to be asked why Moruya and not the Royal Easter Show as they also conduct a much larger rodeo for the city people or do the minority groups consider Eurobodalla an easy target.

The business community in the Eurobodalla have for many years continues to support both financially and in kind support this event as it has a proven record of bringing to town visitors not only for the day but weeks prior to the event.

The Rodeo, as you will hear from others today has over the decades provided the opportunity for many local charity groups, sporting clubs and the like to generate income to supplement their income to achieve their aims to benefit the community throughout the year. Rotary, The Lions, football clubs, equestrian groups, riding for the disabled, the high school the hospital and others have all benefited from rodeo events. They have all given strong support to this committee over the years and would not be at all happy should council be stupid enough to also not support the Rodeo committee.

The rodeo provides something totally different for the many tourists to do during their stay here over the Christmas/New year's break. It is also abundantly clear that the locals and tourists alike voted with their feet and attended in record numbers not only at Moruya but other rodeos throughout the state.

Councillors your role is to do the best for this shire. To do that you need to provide the infrastructure to enhance both the rural landscape and also to diversify the tourist experience so that we continue to attract a continued and growing tourist trade to the shire. The better that is done the better the chance of lifting the viability of businesses throughout the shire.

Council in the past have invested heavily in such as the multiple parks. foreshore amenities, the botanic gardens recently the Bay community centre.

All of this is to attract and enhance the visitors experience so that this area becomes a repeat visited destination to continue the growth of this Shire. Therefore, it beggers believe that this council is even considering banning a major event that benefits visitors and locals alike.

Councillors today the local community asks and expect you to give your support to the continuation of the Moruya rodeo into the future. As per the recommendation before you this complies with all State government requirements also continuing the long tradition of showcasing the shire's agricultural heritage.

Thank you

Dear Councillors,

I'm speaking to you in the hope that you will very seriously consider not renewing the licence for the Moruya New Year's Day Rodeo, accepting that while it demonstrates brave horsemanship skills, it is cruel to the animals involved in so many ways. I know that, after many discussions with friends and contacts, I represent more than just the average constituent in Moruya, Narooma and Batemans Bay, or even the average visitor, in that we would never attend a rodeo, and would never take children to see this form of entertainment where the animals are made to suffer.

Moruya has been on the Rodeo circuit for about 50 years. Who are the STAKEHOLDERS that you represent?

Firstly, the **Brave young men** who demonstrate their skills of strength, balance and control of a very unwilling horse, calf, steer or bull, their organisers, and the Australian Bushmen's Campdraft and Rodeo Association.

Secondly, the **Residents of Eurobodalla** who might wish to watch a Rodeo, OR may wish to attend a different function on their New Year's Day, more in keeping with the ethos of our south coast shire.

Thirdly, **Visitors who come to Eurobodalla in the summer and especially during school holidays.** Families come from Canberra, Sydney and Melbourne, looking for sunshine and the beach ,to experience life in coastal towns and villages with beautiful bushland, and for the fascinating local history that we have here in Eurobodalla

Fourthly, **Our local businesses and commercial enterprises** who support our towns economically and are vitally important.

Would you, couldn't you, consider options for these stakeholders?

#### **1.** Brave young men often play dangerous sports.

I have four sons, and yes they have all tried to prove themselves in sometimes foolhardy situations, like being a Whitewater Rafting Guide through Devils Gap on the confluence of two great Rivers in BC Canada, or helping to pull down the Berlin Wall, but none of them have entertained the public by causing pain and suffering to an animal, even if those animals are well fed and cared for at other times. Nearly all, if not all, of these animals used in Rodeos are not aggressive by nature, they are physically provoked into displaying 'wild' behaviour so that the audience could witness bravery.

Could there be a new competition developed by the camp drafters to demonstrate those skills where rider and horse work together?

#### 2. Residents of Eurobodalla

As elected councillors don't you owe residents a celebration on New Years Day that reflects our shires present achievements and past history of the struggles of early settlers, the floods and the fires, the gold mining era and the bushranger stories. Those who love to watch horse riding skills, and those who wish to get involved themselves, could enjoy the barrel racing and the many other competitive games that used to be run at the Deua River Bush Races. (It was so well attended and only ceased because of the cost of insurance,)

#### 3. The Visitors to Eurobodalla

They would surely enjoy a show with some of the items above, and a really popular event with young families is a farm animal nursery, where the young calves, maybe a foal, piglets, chicks, rabbits, baby goats and others are in a supervised enclosure while children are allowed to come close and learn how they are fed and cared for.

#### 4. Our local businesses and commercial enterprises

We could support them by a much more diverse celebration on New Years Day when so many visitors swell the numbers in our shire, more than at any other time. In the evening when folks have recovered from the parties of the previous night, instead of the rodeo with its associated cruelty to animals as reported by the Animals Australia group, the Animal Liberation Group, the RSPCA., and others. Could we not offer some family-centred events, like gathering around a wellcontrolled brazier to watch a re-enactment of a bushrangers story, or tales of the early settlers here? Local businesses could supply refreshments and souvenirs and, stock for the horse related events.

If on the other hand you decide to renew the Rodeo licence, you will be delivering the animals involved once again into an ongoing cycle where they are bewildered, then terrified with apprehension, as they anticipate the pain. Surely as the animals arrive the day before the Rodeo they are kept yarded in the hot sun of January 1st with no protection from the sun. Next day from 1.00pm when it's their turn to be used for entertainment ,.they come from the yarding to the chute and the horses and steers and bulls must know from previous experience that their pain and fear, and the infuriation for the bulls is about to start all over again.

In the Saddle Bronc Riding, once the bucking strap is tightened around the groin area and they are prodded out into the arena in front of a crowd, most points are scored for the spurring action from the horse's shoulder to the cantle (just behind the saddle). Points are awarded for bucking action strength. How painful for the horse ..No wonder they buck high. In Bareback Bronc Riding, where the rider lies flat along the horse's back without a saddle, ( how unnatural a position) ,the higher and wider the spurring action, from the withers down the shoulders, the better the score. If you look closely at videos of this you will see the scraped area on the poor horse's shoulders.

In steer wrestling the steer's horns are sometimes broken off and in Bull riding infuriated bulls have been known to break their spine or fracture a leg and then need to be euthanized.

The young calves who are sent alone into the ring, terrified, are then pursued by the horse and rider, lassoed around the neck, thrown to the ground and then have 3 legs tied together. This will be repeated through the show and can cause long term physical damage.

Also, our brave young men can themselves be injured in these dangerous situations where Horse and Bull feel tortured and abused or are in extreme discomfort. This year a young competitor lost his life in a Rodeo in Queensland. So, Councillors, in conclusion, I ask you to consider not only all the Stakeholder groups, but most of all the Animals kept for the purpose of entertainment in Rodeos, and please do not renew the 5 year Rodeo licence in Eurobodalla.

Good morning Mayor, Councillors, General Manager, Staff, Gallery and those comfortable zooming from home my name is Patricia Hellier from Batemans Bay.

I am here today to speak on item No PSR23/007 Licence for the Moruya Rodeo – Moruya Showground.

Councillors I have no doubt today you will hear from some members of the community who will provide their version and their interruption of the NSW Legislation in relation to this item. There is a possibility that there will be those who will try and provide their own legal interpretation. Councillors I am here to remind you that you are here to ensure that the Moruya Rodeo Committee has ticked all the relevant boxes under the required NSW Legislation for this Licence.

As a regular observer of Council Meetings I watched the debate on the 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2022 in relation to the Rodeo Licence and I must admit I have re-watched the Live Streaming. I listened to both sides of the debate. Within days of this Council meeting I was sent copies of items that appeared on Face Book which were photos of cows it was quite obvious that these photos did not come from any event from a Moruya Rodeo and there was one photo that literally showed a calf being dragged from the teat of its mother.

It became obvious that FB was being used as a tool to try and sabotage the NYE Rodeo Event. On one particular FB site items were being displayed and yet comments were blocked therefore it was obvious the writer only wanted to provide what I believe was a very warped one side of the debate.

On the day of the Rodeo the author of the opposition FB sites was asking for the Live Streaming Link to Live Stream the event when a member the community replied saying "the event was not being Live Streamed".

Sometime after the event I believe the situation became worse as it became evident the Rodeo was a complete success with a record number of attendees. I was sent a copy of a photo where the Rodeo Committee donated a sum of money to a voluntary organisation there was a comment below the photo from this person who had ran the opposition FB site and I quote "Check this out the low attempt to win support which will only backfire on these hideous cowboys .... have no shame" unquote. I firmly believe comments like these are totally uncalled for and it is known that the Rodeo Committee have worked hard and has always been an organisations who has given back to the community.

On the opposition FB site there has been a continual request for signatures for their "On Line Petition" and there are some within this shire that want to rewrite the rule book in relation to a number of issues and I would like to remind everyone that we operate under a Code of Meeting Practice. It clearly states in the COMP under the heading of be "Please aware that the Petition mus"t: -consists only of original, hand written signatures (photocopies, faxes or electronic signatures are not accepted). Therefore if the signatures have been obtain through electronic means they can not be accepted and I believe this petition has been circulated world wide and yet the numbers acquired do not represent the worlds population.

Recently the ABC aired a segment on a remote community in outback WA each year they held an annual Rodeo this was the only event that bought everyone from the community together they interview indigenous woman who stated that she had been put on a steer at a very early age, she was now in her 60's and was looking forward to have have a ride that day, and she added "and if I am still around when I'm 90 if I can't hop onto a steer my boys can lift me on". The majority of participants at the Rodeo came from the Indigenous Community.

A previous speaker mentioned the 2016 Hunsfest Promotion I sat in this gallery during that debate the speaker today stated "Hunsfest died a natural death" - I dispute this I believe Hunsfest was targeted in a similar fashion as the Moruya Rodeo.

It is quite obvious Rodeo's bring communities together and for those that object to Rodeo's they arr not obligated to attend and that is their choice.

Councillors I ask you please don't allow what happened to Hunsfest Promotion happen to the Moruya Rodeo it is a most important advent that brings a number of people to this shire and the history has shown there has been very, very little injury to both animal and participants. Thank you.

Patricia Hellier



27th March 2023

#### Council Meeting 28 March 2023 – Moruya Rodeo Licence: LI34400 Presentation on behalf of RSPCA Australia and RSPCA NSW

Thank you to the Eurobodalla Council for the opportunity to speak.

My name is Dr Di Evans - I am a veterinarian and I work as a Senior Scientific Officer for RSPCA Australia and I speak on behalf of RSPCA Australia and RSPCA NSW. I have worked in the agricultural sector for over 20 years in a previous role with the WA Department of Agriculture where I promoted and coordinated low stress stock handling training for the farming sector. I have credentials in animal welfare through examination in 2008 for the Australian and New Zealand College of Veterinary Scientists and I am also the current President of the Animal Welfare Chapter for the College. I have attended rodeos and analysed hours of footage which provides a unique insight into how animals react to being treated in rodeo events. The true impact on animals used in rodeos may not be apparent to spectators or even those involved in events, as events occur quickly, most of the focus is on the competitor and most people are unaware of the signs to look for.

The RSPCA opposes rodeos and rodeo schools because of the potential for significant injury, suffering or distress to the animals involved. The use of painful devices such as flank straps and electric prods contributes to suffering associated with this sport. for example, calves are chased, choked when lassoed, forced to the ground and may be choked again when being dragged whilst their legs are tied.

I have worked with the University of Sydney which has published two studies in the past three years in a leading international animal welfare journal which show that calves display behaviours which indicate they experience fear, stress and pain during rope and tie events. They try to escape at every opportunity (this is a flight stress response), they bellow and roll their eyes - these are obvious signs that they are distressed.

In addition, the risks of injury associated with calf rope and tie events include:

- damage to the windpipe and soft tissues of the neck due to being suddenly jerked in a different direction to which the calf is running; you only need to lightly touch your windpipe to know how painful this can be
- $\circ$  bruising and broken ribs as the young animal is forced to the ground
- choking causing damage to the windpipe and neck tissues from being dragged along the ground.

As a prey species, calves will mask signs of fear and pain as a survival instinct to avoid being detected by predators. So, when we see bellowing and desperate attempts to escape, we know that these animals are being subjected to significant negative impacts. In addition, these very young calves are subjected to this inhumane treatment time and time again during rodeos and when being used in training schools.

The industry claims that a special roping device acts as a shock absorber but this has not been proven to be effective during roping and cannot prevent what can only be described as 'horizontal hanging' when these baby calves are lassoed. Many animal welfare organisations recognise these significant negative impacts including the Australian Veterinary Association which does not support calf roping.

**RSPCA** Australia

ABN 99 668 654 249 ACN 163 614 668

P 02 6282 8300
 F 02 6282 8311
 E rspca@rspca.org.au
 W rspca.org.au

PO Box 265 Deakin West ACT 2600





In terms of bucking events, horses and bulls are subjected to being ridden, having a flank strap tightened around their sensitive underbelly and horses are spurred. These are prey species and so they instinctively buck as a fight stress response to the presence of a perceived predator or threat - that is, the rider on their back and the tightened flank strap. The industry claims these animals are trained but if modern training methods were used, they would not require a flank strap to initiate bucking. Again, these animals display fear, stress and pain as evidenced by their attempts to rear out of the chutes with some horses blindly hitting rails, somersaulting or crashing to the ground; bulls have suffered catastrophic leg fractures. Furthermore, a comparative study has shown that over 70% of bucking bulls showed muscle and bone injuries compared to 46% of bulls not used for bucking in rodeos and that bucking bulls were 13 times more likely to have a spinal disorder than non-bucking bulls and they were more likely to develop horn disorders.

None of these events reflect what happens on farms - the livestock industry is working hard to promote low stress stock handling based on principles of being calm, quiet and gentle to minimise stress. Low stress stock handling makes sense in terms of safe work practices for people, improves efficiency and therefore productivity as well as for good animal welfare. Rodeo completely contradicts low stress stock handling principles.

Rodeo is also promoted as family fun entertainment. It is definitely not fun for the animals and unless all participants have a choice and opportunity to participate or not, then it is also not just. Furthermore, rodeo animals are subjected to this inhumane treatment repeatedly. It is extremely disappointing that children not only attend but are also encouraged to participate in these activities. This sends the wrong message - and that is that animals can be used in a detrimental way for our own entertainment.

Some people may believe that because rodeos are legal, there must be no animal cruelty. However, this is not the case. Rodeos are protected through a voluntary code of practice because without it, organisers and participants would be liable to prosecution under animal welfare legislation. The Code actually protects the industry rather than what it is designed to do and that is to protect animals from cruelty. Rodeos are prohibited in the ACT and due to a minimum body weight requirement, calf roping is essentially prohibited in Victoria and South Australia on animal welfare grounds.

Social and economic benefits are often cited to justify the continuation of rodeos but these don't outweigh the harm being caused. It is interesting to note that the tourism industry is focusing more and more on animal welfare with some major operators (such as TripAdvisor; Expedia) have developed animal welfare policies and boycotting some animal based activities. The new animal guidelines focus on six key areas including behaviour, choice and control, and mental state (the latter is what the animal is experiencing and feeling). We now see Expedia has prohibited promoting interactions with or performances by dolphins, whales, and other cetaceans - this would not have happened 10 years ago. This trend is increasing as more tourists choose to engage in animal friendly interactions. There are many other ways to bring social connection and financial benefits to rural communities without harming animals.

The RSPCA has commissioned Australia wide surveys (including urban and rural areas) conducted by an independent research company which have shown that in 2022, the majority (67%) of Australians are concerned or very concerned about the welfare of animals used in rodeos.



This is an increase of 15% since 2015. There is an expectation that this number will increase in the future as the community becomes more aware of the impacts of the treatment of animals used in rodeos. This in turn will see less sponsorship as businesses decline being associated with events which cause unnecessary harm to animals.

In conclusion, councils are increasingly recognising their role in shaping and leading the way on social issues in their local community, including how animals are treated. Councils have an opportunity to align with community expectations and to be viewed as leaders in recognising the importance of animal welfare regarding the use of animals in tourism and entertainment. Discontinuing approval to use local show grounds or other council managed land does not prevent rodeos from seeking private properties to host events. The use of private land already happens in many parts of Australia.

Rodeos are a tradition with an increasingly vulnerable social license. The focus and evidence on the negative impact rodeos have on animals is becoming stronger. Rodeos also do not reflect what happens on farms and so lacks legitimacy in terms of relevance to rural practices.

We hope that the information we have provided will assist in the council's decision making on the matter.

Thank you.

Dr Di Evans BSc BVMS MPhil MANZCVS (Animal Welfare)

#### Dr Philip A. Creagh BVSc., CQCVMA

#### Public Forum: Licence for Moruya Rodeo. PSR23/007

#### Councillors

My name is Philip Creagh and my presentation supports the granting of the five year extension for the Moruya Rodeo.

I am a retired Veterinarian with over forty years experience in the handling and treatment of both small and large animals in Australia, the Sudan, Canada and England.

I fear that some Councillors opinions have been swayed by organizations that would ultimately see the farming of ALL animals banned, horse and greyhound racing banned and even the keeping of pets severely curtailed. Their modus operandi is anthropomorphism, or equating the feelings of animals to humans, especially in the way they feel pain. Their appeals to the public are based on emotion and not logic.

Councillors to understand the concept of stress and pain in relation to animals you need a good understanding of neuroanatomy. In particular the study of the brain in various species. This is called comparative neuroanatomy and is one of the core subjects in Veterinary Science. For example comparing the brain of a human with a cow or a fish. The principle is that the structures within the brain determine function.

In a couple of paragraphs I will explain why

In the last ten years many studies have indicated the main area of the brain that responds to rapid onset acute pain is the anatomical area called the 'dorsal posterior insula'. There are other areas that respond to longstanding chronic pain, for example an untreated badly broken leg. These areas are not useful in discussing the short term effects of bull riding or calf roping in the rodeo context.

The way this works in comparative neuroanatomy is by comparing the size of the 'dorsal posterior insula' between the brains of different species. In adult cattle it is comparatively reduced in size, in juveniles of all species, much reduced and in fish species it is very much reduced. So with some degree of confidence it can be said that 'pain', as perceived by humans, is much reduced in cattle.

Comparative brain studies also demonstrate why canines have much better olfactory senses than humans, and birds much better discriminatory eyesight.

There are also social, economic and cultural reasons for supporting the granting of a five year lease.

As Councillors will be aware the rodeo has been held for about 50 years. The Moruya Rodeo Committee, all volunteers, organize a successful event for the residents of Eurobodalla, as well as tourists on New Year's day. In 2023 there 4,000 attending. The Rodeo committee should be applauded for making generous donations to our local community groups.

This Rodeo, as do all in NSW, operates within the limits of the NSW Department of Primary Industries code of practice for animals used in rodeos. These are set by the NSW Government, not by PETA, Animal liberation, or dare I say it Eurobodalla Shire Council.

The Australian Veterinary Association's policy on rodeos is well considered, and stipulates that a Veterinarian be involved in the planning and also in attendance for the event. This has been and still is part of the protocol for the Moruya rodeo. The AVA does NOT recommend the banning of rodeos in general or calf-roping in particular.

Councillors there is a choice: Whether to follow the Local Government Act 1993 part 8a, section 1(b) where Council 'should provide the best possible value for residents and ratepayers'. Or do you believe that you should be the moral guardians for the 40,000 residents of our shire?

As an Aboriginal leader and Elder I object and protest against the Moruya rodeo.

Aboriginal people, love animals and do participate in rodeos but forcing animals to be used and put under suffering for the sake of so called sports and entertainment is cruel.

Aboriginal People would never put animals under the conditions at rodeos where they are confused and distressed. The animal has no control over their situation which can cause fear, pain, stress and anxiety.

Indigenous Australians have always been aware of the fact that animals, like humans, are sentient (have feelings are sensitive and are reactive to pain) beings which should be respected.

The Indigenous Australians have complex layers of totems deeply embedded in their culture. For them a totem can be a natural object, a plant or an animal that is inherited by members of a clan or family as their spiritual emblem.

David Dixon, Ngarigo elder, says

Our old people were animal lovers. They would have had great respect for these powerful horse spirits. Our people have always been accepting of visitors to our lands and quite capable of adapting to change so that our visitors can also belong, and have their place.

So, on behalf of other Aboriginal people, I protest and object to the cruelty of animals that is likely to happen at the Moruya rodeo.

Tom Slockee Aboriginal Elder

### SHASA Presentation to Council 28 March 2023 PSR23/011 Draft Electric Vehicle Charging Infrastructure Strategy

I would like to acknowledge the **Walbunja** people and pay my respects to the elders in our community.

I would also like to acknowledge the Mayor Mat Hatcher, Deputy Mayor Alison Worthington, fellow councillors and General Manager Warwick Winn.

I would also like to thank the Council for giving me an opportunity to speak at these very important public forums – a key way the community is able to engage with Council.

Today I am here in my capacity as President of the Southcoast Health and Sustainability Alliance. We are a local community organisation with the goal of undertaking practical projects to achieve a more resilient community and low carbon economy in the Eurobodalla.

SHASA made a decision nearly 3 years ago to drive the electrification of transport in the Eurobodalla. We purchased a Nissan Leaf which has had 150 test drives. Our Vice President Steve Colman and a significant number of SHASA members have purchased electric vehicles. We have assisted businesses to install destination chargers and run two highly successful electric vehicle Expos in Batemans Bay. In the 5 months between these Expos EV sales doubled from 3.39% to 6.8%.

I am speaking on the agenda item of the Draft Electric Vehicle Charging Infrastructure Strategy (EVCI). We welcome the draft strategy and the engagement undertaken by Council with members of the Climate Change Advisory Committee. I will now address the proposed actions in the Strategy:

# 1.0 Work with stakeholders as appropriate to support external suppliers to install EVCI network on Council managed lands in major centres and identified locations in towns and villages.

SHASA would like to see the Council commit to do everything it can to facilitate, as quickly as possible, a network of fast chargers in Batemans Bay, Mogo, Moruya, Bodalla, and Narooma. The Eurobodalla is reliant on 40% of its GDP from tourists and we need to ensure we are an EV tourist friendly destination. We have over 40 petrol/diesel pumps in Moruya and not one EV fast charger.

The Eurobodalla needs multi-bay, ultrafast charging sites to be built so that drivers are able to recharge when making long trips, as well as in urban areas for drivers who can't charge their cars at their homes.

One only had to see the queues at the 3 fast chargers in Batemans Bay over the summer months to see that our fast charging network is woefully inadequate, even for the number of cars we have today. If current trends persist we will see a doubling of EVs in the district in the next 12 months.

## Action 1.2 Investigate options to install e-bike chargers in town centres and/or work with local cycling groups as appropriate to install along major cycling routes.

SHASA would like this strengthened so Council will install an E-bike charger in all town centres, and importantly at the mountain bike track heads in Mogo and Narooma, as more and more mountain bikes are ebikes. Action 1.3 Promote government grants for destination chargers to local businesses and provide support as appropriate. Promote other EV initiatives to residents and businesses.

SHASA approached 30 businesses in the 1st round of destination chargers and we know 4 businesses went ahead – Adelaide Hotel, BB Soldiers Club, Corrigan's Cove, Batehaven, and Moruya Golf Club. SHASA is keen to collaborate with Council to promote any future NSW Government funding for destination chargers. We really need them at all accommodations including cabins at caravan parks.

## Action 1.4 Explore options for installation for kerbside EVCI, especially in residential areas and smaller settlements to provide charging options for renters and visitors.

Strongly supported by SHASA.

# Strategic outcome 2: Identify and prioritise suitable locations for EVCI according to a predefined set of criteria – 4 actions

SHASA believes the Council has a key role to play in educating the residents of the Eurobodalla about the infrastructural changes that are required to transition to electric vehicles.

With every major change there are going to be people who oppose it. SHASA has experienced this at our Batemans Bay Market stalls. There are some in the community who see the move to electric vehicles as an affront to their manhood. The key is that it is an option that has many benefits. No one is being forced to give up their internal combustion engine car. Also SHASA believes it is time for the Council to switch appropriate fleet vehicles to electric. The Mayor has shown leadership with his electric mayoral Tesla. We now need to see this leadership extended to appropriate Council fleet vehicles. With the Federal Government changes to FBT (fringe benefits tax) and removal of the luxury tax on a range of electric vehicles, it is now a very cost effective option. A good place to start is the Council fleet cars at the Council offices in Moruya.

In conclusion, SHASA believes it is time for the Eurobodalla to catch up with other NSW Councils demonstrating leadership in adopting EV use and supporting charging stations:

- Waverley, Woollahra and Randwick councils in Sydney's eastern suburbs were among the first councils in Sydney to install public on-street EV charging stations in key destination hot spots from Coogee to Double Bay;
- City of Newcastle built an E-Transit Hub solar-powered EV charging station that also provides 100 per cent renewable electricity to nearby sports fields;
- Shoalhaven City Council, Wagga Wagga City, and Clarence Valley council, are among a number of councils that are procuring EVs for council vehicle fleets.
- Sutherland Shire council is trialling electric cars and an electric garbage truck.

Thank you for the opportunity to present this paper. Kathryn Maxwell President of SHASA

# Accompanying photos:





